

MINUTES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL SENATE
WEDNESDAY 26 JUNE 2024 / 2PM / MEETING HELD ONLINE VIA ZOOM

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Present: | <p>Professor T Jones (Vice-Chancellor, Chair), Dr A Alsalloum, Dr H Arnolds, Professor K Atkinson, Professor M Baylis, Professor K Bennett, Dr M Berenbrink, Professor N Berry, Professor F Beveridge, Professor R Black, Professor J Bridgeman, Professor G Brown, Professor I Buchan, Dr V Chauvet, Professor R Chiverrell, Professor P Clegg, Professor K Coleman, Professor D Colquitt, Dr S Cornell, Dr L Corner, Professor L Crolley, Professor J Curran, Professor M D’Onofrio, Professor G Endfield, Professor A Fell, Professor L Gahman, Professor M Garcia Finana, Professor B Gibson, Professor L Harkness-Brennan, Professor A Hollander, Professor D Jeater, Professor D Lane, Dr H Little, Professor W Liu, Professor P Lunn, Professor G Lynall, Professor A Lyons, Professor D Mair, Professor P McCormick, Professor V Mitsilegas, Professor M O’Flaherty, Professor K O’Halloran, Professor P Murray, Professor E Patterson, Professor S Rocha, Dr M Rose, Professor H Scott, Professor S Sheard, Professor P Shirlow, Professor R Smith, Professor J Surroca, Professor J Sweeney, Professor T Teubner, Professor W van der Hoek, Professor F Vis, Professor S Voelkel, Professor T Walley and Professor F Watkins.</p> <p>Student Representatives: J Barber, R Bradbury, E Campbell, K Manley, S Mitra and V Samuels.</p> |
| Apologies: | <p>Professor T Ali, Professor J Balogun, Dr C Belfrage, P Brown, Professor P Drake, L Dubbins, Dr K Furman, Professor I Prior, Professor L Kenny, Professor B Konev, Professor D MacEwan, Dr S Parameswaran, Professor H Stalford, Professor M Towsey, Dr B Wilm, and Dr J Woolf.</p> |
| In Attendance: | <p>M Edge (Secretary, Governance, Compliance and Regulatory Manager), K Ryan (University Secretary and General Counsel), K Blundell (Governance Officer, T Choudhary (Strategic Change), J Fitton (Deputy Director of Libraries, Museums and Galleries), Dr M Greenhall (Director of Libraries, Museums and Galleries), Dr P Harrison (Director of Student Life), S Jackson (Director of RPI), G Noonan (Student Conduct Manager), R Parkes (Interim Director, Strategic Change) and R Roach (Governance Clerical Officer).</p> |

COMMITTEE AND MEMBERSHIP MATTERS

1. Update on Ongoing Abercromby Square Protest

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. An oral update from the Provost and Deputy Vice-Chancellor, setting out the latest position, and the University’s approach, to the ongoing Abercromby Square protest.
- ii. Due to the ongoing protests and recent escalations on campus and following the advice of the University’s Campus Support Team, this meeting of Senate was moved online. Whilst the majority of the agenda remain unchanged, a decision was taken to defer the Academic Governance/Senate Effectiveness Review Report from Advance HE to the next meeting of Senate, where colleagues from Advance HE could attend in person and present the report. This particular report would be presented to Council once it had been considered by Senate.

2. Disclosures of Interest

Members were asked to disclose any interest that could give rise to conflict in relation to any item on the agenda. No such interests were disclosed.

3. Minutes of Previous Meetings

3.1 Minutes of the Meeting Held on 20 March 2024

RECEIVED and **AGREED**:

- i. The minutes should be approved as an accurate record.

3.2 Minutes of the Special Meeting Held 22 May 2024

RECEIVED and **AGREED**:

- i. The minutes should be approved as an accurate record.

4. Report on Action Taken by the Chair on Behalf of Senate

RECEIVED and **NOTED**:

- i. A paper summarising the activity taken by the Chair on behalf of Senate. Since the last meeting, Chair's action had been taken on the following matters:
 - a. To approve the arrangement with Royal University for Women, Bahrain, to deliver the University LLM in International Business and Commercial Law.
 - b. To approve a new Faculty of Health and Life Sciences Master's Award: Master of Bovine Reproduction.

AGREED:

- ii. The action taken by the Chair on behalf of Senate should be endorsed.

5. Vice-Chancellor's Report

RECEIVED:

- i. A report from the Vice-Chancellor on University, sector wide, and political news, covering:

University Updates

- Condolences for the passing of Phil Leonard, Head of Student Administration
- New Chief Operating Officer
- Latest University league table rankings
- University Race Equality Charter Action Plan
- Implementation of the Living Wage Foundation's recommended Living Wage, with effect from 1 April 2024
- Improvements to Family Friendly Policies
- National Student Survey
- Summer internships in US for Law Students

- University delegation visit to Shanghai
 - Taicang 2+1+1 programme
 - Hong Kong visit
- Higher Education Sector and Political Updates
- Outcome of the Government's Migration Advisory Committee (MAC) review
 - Protest on Abercromby Square
 - Investment Zone update
 - Leahurst Stakeholder event
 - Heseltine Institute's Manifesto for the Liverpool City Region
 - Visit from the Chief Scientific Adviser for the Department for Business and Trade
 - London Economics Report, assessing impact of Russell Group universities
 - UUK manifesto of an incoming government.

STRATEGIC MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION

6. Curriculum Project Progress Update

RECEIVED:

- i. A paper, and accompanying presentation, which outlined the high-level steps that would be taken to develop a detailed implementation plan and associated timeline for the Curriculum Project.

REPORTED:

- ii. Two elements of the Curriculum Project had been approved by Senate on 22 May, namely:
 - A new approach to structuring programmes that would help manage timetable complexity, both within individual programmes and across related programmes and departments
 - A new institutional Learning Framework that would develop graduates as employable, socially responsible global citizens, emphasising holistic skills alongside disciplinary knowledge.

NOTED:

- iii. Consultation and engagement would continue with key stakeholders through a number of Working Groups to develop each element. Further details would be shared with Senate in due course on both the Programme Structure and Liverpool Learning Framework.
- iv. The module rationalisation project would support Faculty APVCs for Education, and Deans, to review existing module offerings and develop principles to support academic areas in assessing their current portfolio of modules and programmes. There may well be good reasons why certain modules had few students and this would be considered as part of these discussions. The timing of any potential changes, lifespan of programmes, and the importance of clear communication with students that could potentially be affected were also highlighted as key points to consider.

- v. Reassurance was provided that the University was only looking at modules that had historically, and continued to have, low numbers of students.
- vi. Digital and AI as an enabler of learning and teaching was one of the ten principles identified as part of the Liverpool Learning Framework. Senate agreed that it should have a deeper discussion on the impact of AI in learning and assessment next academic year.
- vii. There were slight differences in the timeline presented in the paper versus what was shared as part of the presentation. Senate would be kept informed of progress and an updated timeline would be shared.
- viii. The review of the quality assurance and approvals processes and associated paperwork continued, taking into account feedback from users, and aiming to accommodate the required scale of work in reviewing all programmes. This review would focus on seeking efficiencies while maintaining compliance with internal and external quality expectations. A query was raised on whether this work would be presented to Senate in detail, it was explained that it would depend on the materiality of the proposed changes.

7. Review of PDR Narrative Statement Pilot and Proposals for Wider Adoption

RECEIVED:

- i. A paper, and supporting presentation, detailing the approach to the Narrative Statement PDR pilot and recommendations, plus a copy of the Equality Impact Assessment.

REPORTED:

- ii. The drivers for the new approach were to support research funding applications, the research environment, and inclusion and career development. The pilot had involved 77 colleagues from across Faculties and at different career stages. The feedback was positive, 85% reviewees and 100% reviewers said it helped demonstrate contributions to research and impact, while 93% reviewees and 90% reviewers said it helped demonstrate contributions to teaching, learning and student experience.
- iii. The Narrative Statement PDR approach would be rolled out across the University for 2024/25 and launched in October. Other key recommendations included, to:
 - a. Develop a Scholarship and Impact Contributions Framework (November 2024) that was appropriate for all staff with education, teaching and scholarship responsibilities. It was anticipated that this would be presented to Senate next academic year.
 - b. Share exemplar narrative PDRs as part of training/guidance.
 - c. Explore ways to improve efficiencies with Portfolio of activity and academic portfolio planning.
 - d. Explore ways to pre-populate activity data via interfacing with e.g. Elements, TULIP.
- iv. These changes were not applicable to colleagues in Professional Services.

NOTED:

- v. The majority of the pilot group were on a Teaching and Research (T&R) contract and a query was raised over whether this would result in any inequality between individuals on T&R and Teaching and Scholarship (T&S) contracts. It was explained that colleagues on T&S contracts were also involved in developments before the pilot, and the plans to develop a Scholarship and Impact Contributions Framework would help colleagues understand expected contribution.
- vi. It would be important to apply consistency in how PDRs were used across the University. The planned training would include both reviewee and reviewer focused sessions.
- vii. A concern was raised on output evaluation scores being used as a form of performance management in capability cases. It was confirmed that this would not be the case, and the RISE paper presented to Senate in June 2023 had already confirmed that output evaluation was taking place specifically for REF purposes.
- viii. The RISE White paper presented in June 2023, specifically the Research and Impact Contributions Framework, had acknowledged that the quality and quantity of contribution would vary between individuals and across the categories at different times and career stages, and that the PDR discussion would acknowledge this and specific individual circumstances that may impact the nature of contributions. This was also reiterated in the Narrative Statement PDR guidance.
- ix. The Portfolio of Activity currently remained unchanged. However, both the Portfolio of Activity and Academic Portfolio Planning would be reviewed to understand opportunities to improve efficiencies.
- x. The Equality Impact Assessment undertaken had confirmed that the new Narrative Statement PDR would have a range of positive impacts on the research environment and for staff with protected characteristics. However, two potential negative impacts had been identified, on staff who were neurodivergent, and for colleagues for whom English was not their first language. Whilst actions were proposed and in progress to address those, and agreed with the Disability Staff Network, it was agreed that these were issues that existed with the current PDR system and that this change to a Narrative Statement approach provided an excellent opportunity to improve this.
- xi. The approach of the Narrative Statement PDR reflected the direction of travel within the sector and presented a real opportunity for the University to support its wider objectives.

AGREED:

- xii The Narrative Statement PDR pilot, EQIA, and recommendations should be endorsed, taking account of the feedback above.

8. Academic Governance/Senate Effectiveness Review – Final Report

NOTED:

- i. As noted above under agenda item 1, this report would be deferred to the next meeting of Senate, scheduled for Wednesday 20 November 2024.

BUSINESS FROM FACULTIES

No business received from the Faculties.

REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES

9. Academic, Quality and Standards Committee (AQSC)

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of AQSC held on 1 May 2024, presenting two proposals:
 - a. Changes to the Policy on Student Evaluation of Modules and Programmes – to change the mode of operation for the conduct of evaluation surveys from anonymous to confidential, such that, in very limited and very specific circumstances, a student could be identified from a survey they had completed and submitted.
 - b. Changes to Ordinance 18 to include a new award and changes to the listing of existing awards under the Faculties – the University had recently approved a new XJLTU programme: EdD Doctor of Education, and it included an exit award of Master of Education (MEd). As both would be awards of the University, it was necessary to revise Ordinance 18 to include the Master of Education in the list of awards, effective from 2024-25. AQSC considered that the award should be listed not only under the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, but should also be listed under the headings for the Faculty of Health and Life Sciences. Further to this, the Doctor of Education EdD award should also be listed under the HLS and S&E Faculties, and not just the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences

AGREED:

- ii. The two proposals as detailed above should be approved.

10. Collaborative Provision Committee (CPC)

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the CPC held on 3 May 2024, covering:
 - Royal University for Women, Bahrain
 - Global Opportunities (new student exchanges and global opportunities annual monitoring report)
 - XJTLU (new student exchange and base moderation)
 - Annual Monitoring Reports (Carmel College and UK Degree Transfer Partners)

- London School of Architecture Annual Monitoring Visit Report
- Liverpool Online Quality Assurance Operational Framework (Annual Review).

11. Education Committee

RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Education Committee held on 12 June 2024, covering:
 - Student Conduct Policy
 - Curriculum Project
 - Approval of revisions to the University's Student Protection Plan (which would require submission to the Office for Students)
 - KPIs - Supporting Performance Metrics and Targets
 - Preparations for Welcome Week
 - Student Partners Evaluation
 - Student Success Board
 - Update from Academy
 - Winners of the Sir Alistair Pilkington, Learning & Teaching and Student Experience Awards
 - Guild Awards.

12. Postgraduate Research (PGR) Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the PGR Committee held on 11 June 2024, covering:
 - Revision to Internal Periodic Review (IPR) Guidance
 - Revision to PGR Exams Policy (Appendix 8 of the PGR Code of Practice)
 - PGR Exit Survey
 - PGR Intake Numbers
 - PGR Enhancement Project
 - Research Collaboration Advice Team (RCAT) Update
 - Task & Finish Groups reporting to the PGR Leadership Group
 - Postgraduate Researchers with teaching responsibilities & Graduate Teaching Assistants (GTAs) / Fellows
 - The Obligatory Training Working Group
 - Parental Leave
 - XJTLU Strategy Update
 - Report on PGR Development Initiatives from The Academy
 - Internal Periodic Reviews (IPRs).

REPORTED:

- ii. PGR Committee had recommended for approval the following revisions:
 - a. Internal Periodic Review (IPR) Guidance: A recommendation arising from the Institute of Infection, Veterinary & Ecological Sciences (IVES) Internal Periodic Review resulted in an action to revise the PGR Internal Periodic Review (IPR) Guidance to enable students and staff from review areas to

submit anonymous feedback for consideration by the Periodic Review Panel.

- b. Appendix 8 PGR Code of Practice (CoP) - Exams Policy: a proposal to:
- extend the deadline for Examiners to review major modifications to a PGR thesis from 10 working days to one month
 - revise the criteria for appointment of Independent Chairs to remove some of the restrictions on which Schools/Institutes Independent Chairs could be drawn from, and instead to emphasise that they must have not been involved with the student's supervision, pastoral support, assessment (including progress reviews) or research project. Additionally, it was proposed that Independent Chairs must not have any substantial collaborative links with the Internal Examiner or the student's supervisors.

AGREED:

- iii. The following recommendations should be approved:
- a. To amend the PGR Internal Periodic Review (IPR) Guidance to enable students and staff from review areas to submit anonymous feedback for consideration by the Periodic Review Panel.
 - b. To amend the PGR Exams Policy (Appendix 8 of the PGR Code of Practice) to extend the deadline for Examiners to review major modifications to a PGR thesis from 10 working days to one month.
 - c. To amend the PGR Exams Policy (Appendix 8 of the PGR Code of Practice) to revise the criteria for appointment of Independent Chairs.

13. Research and Impact Committee

RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Research and Impact Committee held on 12 June 2024, covering:
- Updated Research Publication and Copyright Policy
 - Update presentations from APVCS
 - Reimagining the PhD
 - Draft Response to REF Open Access Consultation.

REPORTED:

- ii. A minor change was proposed to the Research Publication and Copyright Policy. This change was to extend the review date to 2025 as the Policy was currently working well after the first year of implementation.

NOTED:

- iii. A query was raised on whether the University had similar guidance concerning IP rights for Education activity. This would be given further consideration.

- iv. A request to be able to access additional information referred to in the sub-committee reports. The Chairs would be happy to answer any additional queries outside of the meeting.

AGREED:

- v. The revisions to the Research Publication and Copyright Policy should be approved.

OTHER ITEMS

14. Policy Updates

14.1 Policy and Code of Practice Regarding Freedom of Speech and Academic Freedom

RECEIVED:

- i. A copy of the University's revised Policy and Code of Practice Regarding Freedom of Speech and Academic Freedom.

REPORTED:

- ii. The main revisions to the Policy included:
 - A formalised position as a Joint Code with the Guild of Students, with a requirement that it was approved individually by each of the institutions' governing bodies.
 - Definition of Freedom of Speech.
 - Information about staff training and awareness raising and bringing the Policy to the attention of students once a year.
 - Reference to the OfS Freedom of Speech Complaints Scheme.
 - Responsibilities for Departmental room bookings.
 - A section on Academic Freedom- teaching and curriculum content. Previously, the Policy had focused on events and speakers, there was a requirement to be clear that this covered all activity.
 - Removal of Appendices and the Overview of the Booking Process to make them available as links.
 - Terminology and Titles updated and document re-numbered.

NOTED:

- iii. The Policy would be revised again once the final OfS Regulatory Advice was available, to ensure compliance.
- iv. A query was raised if the conduct referred to at point 9.1.8 of the Policy was open to interpretation. It was noted that it may take some time for precedent to set out what would be acceptable or not.
- v. The complexity and potential challenges for institutions in upholding both their responsibilities around Freedom of Speech and Equality, which could potentially conflict at times, was discussed.
- vi. A query was raised on point 9.1.11 of the Policy around leaving premises undamaged, and in a clean and tidy condition, and whether this undermined

the seriousness of freedom of speech. This was not a new section and its focus was primarily on ensuring premises were left undamaged, and therefore would be retained.

AGREED:

- vii. Section 6.2 should be expanded to also reference Dean of School (in addition to Head of Department).

AGREED TO RECOMMEND:

- viii. The University's revised Policy and Code of Practice Regarding Freedom of Speech and Academic Freedom should be approved, subject to the minor update above, noting that the Policy would be revisited once the final OfS guidance was issued.

14.2 Student Conduct Policy

RECEIVED:

- i. A copy of the University's revised Student Conduct Policy and related procedures, with the intention that the suggested changes could be implemented at the start of the 2024/25 academic year.

REPORTED:

- ii. Changes were being requested to make the Policy and Procedures more trauma informed, in the hope that this would improve the student and staff experience when dealing with allegations of student misconduct.
- iii. The review of the Policy had also considered the duty the University had to promote freedom of speech within the law, and this was reflected in the removal of some of the original terminology used.

NOTED:

- iv. The use of financial sanctions was queried at Senate, and whether this was still appropriate as it could disproportionately impact on some students depending on their financial situation. It was confirmed that financial sanctions were used more as a deterrent where other sanctions were not effective. It was agreed to consider this point further.

AGREED TO RECOMMEND:

- v. The University's Student Conduct Policy and related procedures, should be approved, subject to further considering the feedback above.

Post Meeting Note: *Upon further review following Senate it was determined that there are sufficient safeguards in place to ensure that students will not be disproportionately financially impacted by sanctions.*

15. Reimagining Libraries, Museums and Galleries: Our Strategic Plan for 2024-2031

NOTED:

- i. Due to time restrictions this item would be deferred.

16. Thank You

NOTED:

- i. The Guild Officers and the Faculty Student Representatives were thanked for their valuable contributions to the work of Senate.

17. Meetings Schedule 2024/25

NOTED:

- i. The meetings schedule for next academic year would be as follows:
 - Wednesday 20 November 2024, 2pm
 - Wednesday 29 January 2025, 2pm
 - Wednesday 19 March 2025, 2pm
 - Wednesday 25 June 2025, 2pm.